#### **Evaluation of Clubroot Control Strategies, Survey Results of Spore Populations**

Venkat Chapara PhD Plant Pathologist, Langdon REC November 4<sup>th</sup>, 15<sup>Th</sup> Annual NCGA Meeting

# NDSU NORTH DAKOTA AGRICULTURAL EXPERIMENT STATION

# Outline



- Annual Survey
- Prevalence of Clubroot in ND through Quantification studies-2020
- Ongoing Statewide Survey program-2021
- Clubroot Management Studies
- Pathotypes of P. brassicae in North Dakota
- A nuisance pathogen?
- Summary

# Weather in Langdon





# Found very late



#### **Annual Clubroot Survey data of Cavalier County**



# Soil pH-Map of North Dakota-2020

#### Soil pH



4 - 6.6 – Fields with Acidic pH 6.6 - 7.2 - Neutral pH > 7.2- Basic pH

Note: Clubroot Pathogen *Plasmodiophora brassicae* prefers acidic soils can be found in Neutral pH-too.

Drs. Chapara, Liu, Prochaska, Kalil, Jingwei, Shi, Del Rio, Teboh, Chirumamilla, Knodel and Honggang

#### 2020 Clubroot Survey in North Dakota



Note:

2020

#### Take home message

- 26 Counties out of 44 Counties scouted have resting spores of clubroot pathogen
- > > 80,000 spores/g will start showing symptoms under field conditions if the soil has acidic pH and on planting susceptible canola variety
- Presence of resting spores doesn't mean disease

#### Measures to be followed on finding resting spores/g of soil in a field by molecular assays:

- Practice 4-year crop rotation
- Use clubroot resistant variety
- Practice no-till
- Sanitize tillage Equipment,  $\geq$ Planters, Swathers, Combines etc.

Drs. Chapara, Liu, Prochaska, Kalil, Jingwei, Shi, Del Rio, Teboh, Chirumamilla, Knodel and Honggang

# 2021-Ongoing State wide Clubroot survey

- Travis Prochaska, NCREC : 10 Counties
- Audrey Kalil, WREC: 10 Counties
- Dante Marino (Grad Student from Del Rio's lab): 10 Counties
- My self did : 14 Counties
- BASF (Richard Johnson): 16 Samples
- St Paul, MN (Chris Mann, Frog town Farm, Saskatchewan Ministry of Agriculture): Samples are on the way

# Results obtained so far of the soil samples-2021

Sample ID		Ν	W	County	Grower	Ph	spores
BASF-01 -	-	48.54406	-101.534227	Renville	Grant Guidinger	6.03	0
BASF-02	14 -	48.79904	-100.715108	Bottineau	Karson Schepp	6.81	0
BASF-03 -	-	48.30306	-100.324536	McHenry	Peter Haman	6.99	0
BASF-04	8 -	48.61358	-102.082792	Ward	Mugur Bunduc	5.47	0
BASF-05 -	-	47.96438	-101.805193	Ward	Steven Bryelow	6.32	0
BASF-06	2 -	48.44828	-103.728869	Williams	Ben Poeckes	5.2	0

County	# of fields with spores/total surveyed	Resting spore range
Cass	3/10	1200-1800
Barnes	1/20	2600
Ransom	0/20	0
Lamoure	1/20	300
Richland	7/20	300-8200
Sargent	14/20	300-33.5million
Dickey	13/20	600-11.7million
McIntosh	7/20	400-58K
Logan	7/20	400-600
Stutsman	13/20	1000-248K
Kidder	8/20	500-5931100
Emmons	3/20	600-1400
Burleigh	11/20	1100-75.9millions
Morton	10/20	500-12.4489millions
Grant	2/20	700-3300
Sioux	3/20	500-700

Samples collected by Mr. Dante from Dr. Del Rio's lab Molecular testing done by Drs. Gongjun Shi and Liu



### Clubroot Management Studies

- Bio-safe product evaluation on clubroot
- Non-Traditional Products study
- Lime with and without Nontraditional Products



# **Clubroot Trial Activities**





Plot Size: 10 x 5 ft Cultivar: L233P Planting Date: June10th Evaluated in First week of August

# **Clubroot Trial Activities**



# **Evaluation of Bio-safe Products to Manage Clubroot**

	Clubroot							
	Incidence	e DSI (0-						
Treatments	(%)	100)						
Non-treated Check	91	89						
SANIDATE+OXIPHOS+TERRAGROW	10	8						
GUARDA+OHIPHOS+TERRAGROW	27	23						
RANMAN	22	20						
EXTRACT	37	35						
Mean	37	35						
CV%	75	81						
LSD	43	44						
p-Value (0.05)	0.013*	0.014*						

### **Non-traditional Treatments to Manage Clubroot**

	Clubroot											
Treatments	Incidence (%)	Disease severity Index (0-100)	Yield (bu/a)									
Ranman 20 fl. oz/a	87	82	23									
OR-079-B 4 pts/a	95	95	12									
OR 009-A 4 pts/a	86	84	20									
OR-369-A 4 pts/a	92	88	17									
Untreated	92	90	12									
OR-079-B 4 pts/a+OR-329-H 2.8 fl. oz/a	94	89	16									
Mean	91	87	16									
CV (%)	12	17	47									
LSD	NS	NS	NS									
p- Value (0.05)	NS	NS	NS									

Canola Cultivar: L233P

### Evaluation of Non-Traditional Products with and without lime - Results

cv. L233P	Beet lime@ 10t/a					
	_	Treatments	Rate	CR DI		
	Clubroot Disease Index	Ranman+ORO	20 fl oz+2 pt/A	22.5		
	P-value	ORO Zero	СНК	60		
Bloc	0.0006	ORO79 TWO	2 pt/A	44		
Main Plot (Lime vs without Lim	e) 0.0007	ORO79 FOUR	4 pt/A	46		
Main Plot*Bloc	0.038	ORO79 EIGHT	8 pt/A	35		
Sub Plots	0.06	ORO09	4 pt/A	30		
Main Plot*Sub Plot	NS	Mean		40		
		CV%		62		
		LSD(0.05)		14		



#### **Evaluation of non-traditional products with and without Lime on Clubroot of Canola**



■ % Incidence ■ DSI (0-3)



pH Changes observed in Lime applied and non-applied treatments

7

■ pH Before ■ pH After

1.4 to 1.85 units of increase observed



# Pathotypes of P. brassica in North Dakota





# Clubroot on Canola- Pathotype designations of *Plasmodiphora brassicae* from North Dakota

Common Clubroot Pathotypes: 2,3,5,6 and 8 (Williams et al. 1966) - 4 differentials can separate 16 pathotypes (PA is Variant of P3)

Some et al. 1996: P1, P2, P3,P4 and P5 (3 differentials, 5 pathotypes)

Over 35 Pathotypes were Identified in Canada so far as per Canadian Clubroot Differentials {CCD} set; Uses 13 brassica hosts.

Pathotypes are designated as:

3A,2B,5C,3D,8E,2F,5G,3H,5I,8J,5K,5L,6M,8N,3O,8P and 5X

✤ Red font pathotypes are variants that resulted in resistance breakdown in canola CR Cultivars

Strelkov et al. 2020

European Clubroot Differential (ECD) – 15 Differentials can differentiate 35 pathotypes (16/15/15)

#### NDSU NORTH DAKOTA STATE UNIVERSITY

		Plasmodioph			
	Sample	Some et al. (1996)	Williams (1966)	Strelkov et al. (2018)	
	FFCR	P3	8	8	
	MMCR	P3	2	2	
	PBCR-2	P2	8	8	
	RBCR-4	P3	8	8	
	RBCR-5	P3	8	8	
	YCR-16	P3	8	8	
	CBN	P3	8	8D	
	MRCR	P3	3	3В	
	YCR-1	P2	3	3D (Mutant)	
	YCR-3	P3	8	8A	
	YCR-6	P3	8	8A	
	YCR-7	P2	3	3Н	
	YCR-10	P3	3	3E	
NDSU	YCR-12	P3	8	8A	Strelkov S., V. Manoli and V
	YCR-15	P3	8	8A	Chapara 2021

# Pathotypes of ND

- . Pathotypes 3E & 8H have only been reported from ND
- . We found the first pathotype able to overcome first generation CR resistance
- Pathotype 3D (sample YCR-1); this is the 2nd most common resistance breaking pathotype on the Canadian Prairies
- . Pathotype 2C has only been found in MB and ND

# Cultivar screening to the mutant pathotype



# Cultivar screening to the mutant pathotype



# Canola cultivars evaluated in soils detected with mutant pathotype of *P. brassicae*



# A nuisance pathogen?











### Spores of the pathogen that cause Powdery mildew were found





# Summary

- Visual surveys indicate 5% of fields surveyed has Clubroot on Canola in Cavalier County
- Molecular studies of soil samples indicate 59% of the counties surveyed has clubroot resting spores in ND
- Non-traditional products had an effect on Clubroot, however more testing has to be done
- Pathotyping studies found one mutant pathotypes of P. brassicae in Cavalier County (Courtesy: University of Alberta, Edmonton, Canada)
- Clubroot Resistant Varieties are still holding good against the pathotypes present in ND soils except one



### Literature available on clubroot from NDSU

NDSU North Dakota Agricultural Experiment Station



bstract

			(mainer and co	(indencial)		
			Field Iden	ity		
Field ID	Latitude N	Longitude W (-) OR	Town	hlp	Range	Section
atitude and I	ongitude in dec	Imal degrees is preferre	d.			
xample: N: 4 preferences	8.659444 W: 9 or other "setup	8.24444 (GPS coordina "functions within the sy	tes) - GPS c stems softw	ordinates d are.	an be obt	ained thro
Coll Comp	ling Survey	Procedure				
				Inches (a scoops or sure to m to point o	cores from aintain 300 f soll colle	itive samp n each fie D feet fror ction.
Field Approach		7		Inches (a scoops or sure to m. to point o Air-dry th paper box off at one <b>Zhaohu</b> Departn NDSU D P.O. Box Fargo, N	representa cores fror aintain 300 if soil colle e soil samj ee soil samj ee soil samj es and ser of the foil i Llu nent of Pla epartment 6050 ID 58108-6	itive samp n each fie 0 feet fror ction. ples Indoo nd or drop owing ad int Patholi t 7660
Field Approach Preca dispos soll sa	utions: Do not a hable boots and mpling equipm	frive into the field. Wea gloves, and disinfect ye ent in the field.	, pur	Inches (a scoops or scoops or sure to m to point of Air-dry th paper boo off at one <b>Zhaohu</b> Departm NDSU D P.O. Box Fargo, H <b>UPS/FE</b> <b>Zhaohu</b> Departm Walster Fargo, H	representa cores fror antain 300 f soil colle e soil sam es and ser of the foil I Llu nent of Pla epartmeni 6050 ID 58108-f I Llu nent of Pla Hall 306 ID 58102	Itive samp n each fie o feet fror ction. ples Indoc nd or drop owing ad int Patholi t 7660 5050 int Patholi





AR

INTRODUCTION

Plasmodiophora brassicae causes clubroot on canola and is an emerging disease in North Dakota

soils, susceptible cultivar)

anagement guidelines

assicae

Can cause significant yield losses under favorable conditions (low pl

Cultivar resistance, crop rotation and equipment sanitation are some he common recommended practices to manage clubroot lanting resistant cultivars at shorter intervals increases the chansistance breakdown and development of novel pathotypes of I

nowledge on the prevalent pathotypes in an area helps breeders evelop resistant cultivars and to develop integrated disease

Figure 1: Galls on canola roots due to P brassicae infections

e objective of this research is to determine the prev

#### The host range of Plasmodiophora brassicae in North Dakota

Venkataramana Chapara<sup>1</sup>, Prochaska T. J.<sup>2</sup>, and Anitha Chirumamilla<sup>1</sup>

North Dakota State University/Langdon Research Extension Center, Langdon, ND-58249 <sup>2</sup>North Dakota State University/North Central Research Extension Center, Minot, ND-58701 <sup>3</sup>NDSU Extension Service, Langdon, ND-58249 Corresponding author: Venkataramana Chapara Fax number: 7012562580 e-mail address: venkata.chapara@ndsu.edu

#### Abstract

Plasmodiophora brassicae causes clubroot on brassica crops and is a new emerging disease on rapeseed in North Dakota. A two-year study was conducted to document the host range and symptomology on various brassica hosts to P. brassicae infections in field conditions. The results indicated that out of the 13 brassica hosts tested, 12 of them developed ellipsoidal galls on roots exhibiting the clubroot symptomology with a disease index (DI) ranging from 41 to 100%. False flax/ camelina (Camelina sativa) showed the least susceptibility among the brassica hosts tested. Symptomology of clubroot on various brassica hosts will serve as a pictorial guide in the future to educate growers and in choosing non-brassica cover crops in clubroot infected fields.

	Venkat Chapara <sup>1</sup> , and Stephen E. Strelkov <sup>2</sup>														
<sup>1</sup> Langdon Researc <sup>2</sup> l	h Extension Center, North Dakota State University, Langdon, ND, 58249 U.S.A., University of Alberta, Edmonton, AB, Alberta T6G 2P5, Canada.														
TRACT	MATERIALS & METHODS														
eae) on canola (Brassica napus) is North Dakota, causing significant anagement approach, including di cultivar resistance, are pact of this disease. Currently, nagement tool sought by growers for ger rotations out of host crops. Short	• Clubbed gails from 32 carela fields were collected in annual survey of clubroot in North Dakota, USA • Patholyng was clore under survey and the survey of elubroot in North Dakota, USA • Sin representative samples were evaluated for patholyne designation on the Canadian Clubroot Differential (CCD) set • Thirtien differentials were involuted with resting sopres of <i>P</i> brassica and the experiment was repeated • Gails on the differentials were evaluated after 45 days with clubroot • Gails on the differentials were evaluated after 45 days with clubroot • Gails on the differentials were evaluated after 45 days with clubroot • Gails on the differentials were evaluated after 45 days with clubroot • Gails on the differentials were evaluated after 45 days with clubroot • Gails on the differentials were evaluated after 45 days with clubroot • Gails on the differentials were evaluated after 45 days with clubroot • Gails on the differentials were evaluated after 45 days • Gails on the differentials were evaluated after 45 days • Gails on the differentials • Gails on the differentials • Gails • G														
R) canola in clubroot-infested	Net J. Advage Stands Network for National Science Sciences														
evelopment of new CR cultivars, lovel pathotypes of <i>P. brassicae</i> , is															
ware resistant to the provisiont	di Month bi Barlar														

Marine Inte	-																											
		. 1		A.			1		8	1				1								1						
ellan .		1	. 2	1.1	. 1	1	1		1	5	3	3	5	1			1					1		1	1			
anes.		3	5	- A_	8.	8.	× 1		3	4	. 8,	4	- A.		1.	· .	h	1.	1			Pr	. 6	17	8,			
	Sec.																											
Q.V																												
08																												
	1.	14		14					1.1		1.1											1.1		1				
-	1.0	100		1.1		1.1	1.1			1.2	1.1			1.1		1						100		1	1.1			
0.0					1	1	1		1		1							1						1	1.			
DTH.																			10.5									
NOT			. •	•		•					•		•					•				•	•	•				
anda .		. 4		. +				. 4															•					
leit .																4												
and a																4	4											
100		1.4														1.												

Pathotype designations on the CCD set include a number is indicate the classification according to the system of Williams (1966), followed by a letter denoting the CCD designation (e.g., pathotype 2A, 25, 2C) (Sterkov et al. 2020). Advariant et al. 2020)
 Since the CCD set includes all of the differentiated Software et al. (1966) designations according to that system can also be obtained

Colorest and		RES	ULTS			DISCUSSION					
f		North Dako	ta clubroat Pathotype Desig	gnation	* The P. br	assicae pathotype composition in North Dakota					
f		Some et al. (1990)	Williams (1900)	Canadian Clubroot Differential Set	was quite distinct from that reported previously from Alberta, Canada, where the clubroot outbreak is most severe. * None of the pathotypes identified could overcome first generation resistance, and						
	FFCR	P3	8	8 Novel		In North Dakota, clubroot may still be managed by planting CR canola in a minimum 3-year rotation.					
		P3	2	2C	Acknowledgments						
1		P2	8	8N	We thank te	echnical and review assistance of Dr. Strelkov lab					
		P3	8	Novel	thanks to the support given by all the funding agencies: Northern						
	RECRO	P3	8	BD	<ul> <li>Canola Growers Association, State Board of Agriculture Research and Education, ND Crop Protection Product Harmonization Board, and the Northern Canola Research Program (NIFA/USDA).</li> </ul>						
1		P3	8	Novel	Literature Cited						
Construction of the owner of the					Askarian H., (2020). Virule brassicae abli Disease. Strelkov S. E. Hollman K. ar (Plasmodioph Alberta. Cana 10.1080/0706	Alvanama A., Manotti V. P., T. cata, Huang, B.F., and Shinkov R. E. mos specifium of nargine-porce and fable biolesis of Rhemodophore e to overcome resistance in canota (Brassica reput), June 20, Plant Huang S.F., Manotti V. P., Turbud G., Fredux Aggeman R., Kathal et Aual S. (2020). Charakeritansion of disease combined country of day. Canotta Journal of Plant Pathology, DOI: 661.2020.177630.					
-		9 4 1			NDSU	NORTH DAKOTA AGRICULTURAL EXPERIMENT STATION					

### Acknowledgements

- To all the Growers and my colleagues at LREC
- Jacob, Sean, Tucker, Vivek Muddana, Amanda Arens, Sara McGregor, Randy, Mukhlesur, Del Rio, Liu, Shi, Travis, Audrey, Dante Marino, Jan Knodel, Edwin Pearson, Anitha, Todd (Simplot), ORZ supplier Corey Sundby, Shawn Kasprick and Johan Coetzee
- All the Funding Sources: Northern Canola Growers Association, Northern Canola Research Program (USDA/NIFA), SBARE, Cibus, Bio-Safe and ORO AGRI
- Mr. Barry Coleman and all the Canola Board members for their constant updates and guidance
- Dr. Strelkov and Victor Manoli, University of Alberta, Edmonton, Canada
- To the growers and collaborators across the state

resting spores from so

NDSU Soil testing lab and Dr. Liu's lab for Quantification of